Freedom of Information request: 2018/0152

Thank you for your Freedom of Information request received on 28th September 2018 in which you requested the following:

Your Request:

I would like information so that (1) I can understand my company’s ranking in the competition and (2) so that I can understand the impact (if any) that my presentation to the interview panel had on the outcome for

So, in particular I would like information on the findings and outcomes of the panel/interview stage, on 24th July 2018.
I request that the following information be provided:

1. Scoring / ranking criteria used by the interview panel.

5. Scores of all applicants

Any other materials which are relevant to my getting a full understanding of the interview process and outcome.

Our response:

I can confirm UK Research and Innovation hold information relevant to your request.

Please see the information relevant to your request below:

1. Scoring / ranking criteria used by the interview panel.

We are unable to provide assessor scoring/ranking criteria as we believe this request comes under the scope of the following exception:

Section 43 (2) exempts information whose disclosure would, or would be likely to, prejudice the commercial interests of any person (an individual, a company, the public authority itself or any other legal entity).

Section 43 (2) is a qualified exemption meaning that it was necessary to conduct a Public Interest Test to determine whether the public interest outweighed the effect on commercial interests.
When assessing whether or not it was in the public interest to disclose the information to you, we took into account the following factors:

Public Interest test in favour of disclosure:

- To ensure that Innovate UK is consistent and compliant with their own assessor guidance and criteria. Innovate UK receives a large volume of applications to their competition. As this is the case examining the guidance and criteria used by Innovate UK’s assessors to ensure they are complying with the stated standards would be in the public interest.

Public interest test in favour of withholding the information:

- Releasing the assessor guidance and marking criteria could give certain applicants an unfair advantage in Innovate UK’s competitions. The assessor marking criteria guidance are not publicly available and could therefore give an unfair advantage to any applicants with access to these documents. To explain further, the documents will be utilised for future competitions. As this is the case we believe releasing the documents would negatively affect the commercial interests of all applicants who do not have access to this information and give those applicants with access an unfair advantage in future competitions. In our view, we do not consider the release of such information would enable fair competition between the organisations that apply.

- Releasing the documents would effect the integrity of Innovate UK competitions due to the advantage having the marking criteria. If released it will also have an impact on the commercial interests of Innovate UK and our reliance on running a fair and transparent competition process. This process ensures that only the best projects receive any public monies. Releasing the assessor’s scoring sheets, guidance and briefs will hugely impact Innovate UK’s core activities and could further compromise the integrity of Innovate UK as an organisation.
5. **Scores of all applicants**

We are exempting the scores of all the applicants as we believe this falls under Section 41, Information provided in confidence therefore. To explain further, applicants submit their grant proposal in confidence with the understanding that details of their application, including their scores will remain confidential. If released we believe it would result in an actionable breach of confidence. As this exemption is absolute there is no requirement to conduct a public interest test.

However, although we cannot disclose each participants score, we can disclose that the highest funded score was 87.20% and the lowest funded score was 66.40%

6. **Any other materials which are relevant to my getting a full understanding of the interview process and outcome.**

We do not have any further information.

If you have any queries about this response please contact me, or if you are unhappy with the service you have received in relation to your request and wish to request a review of our decision, please write to:

**Complaints Officer**

UK Research and Innovation  
Polaris House  
North Star Avenue  
Swindon  
SN2 1FL  
Email: foi@ukri.org

Please quote the reference number above in any future communications.

If you are still not content with the outcome of the review, you may apply to refer the matter to the Information Commissioner for a decision. Generally, the ICO cannot make a decision unless you have exhausted the review procedure provided by UKRI. The Information Commissioner can be contacted at:

**Information Commissioner**  
Wycliffe House,  
Water Lane  
Wilmslow  
Cheshire  
SK9 5AF

Enquiry/Information Line: Between 9am and 5pm Monday to Friday 0303 123 1113 or 01625 545745
Further information about the Office of the Information Commissioner can be found at http://www.ico.gov.uk/

Yours sincerely,

[Signature]

UK Research and Innovation, Information Governance Team

Email: foi@ukri.org