
Thank you for your Freedom of Information request received on 1st March 2019 in which you requested the following:

Your Request:

I am writing to you, as panel convenor for the Centres for Doctoral Training Panel K, to ask for some information. Can you please send me:

(i) The information pack or guidance provided to the panel in advance of the interview process.
(ii) The review scores for each of the 10 applications assessed at panel K.
(iii) A list of any ranking or ordering of the 10 grants at panel K made by the panel after the interview process.

Our response:

I can confirm UK Research and Innovation hold information relevant to your request.

Point (i)
The information requested under (i) was previously provided to you and therefore has not been included in this response.

Point (ii)
Given the comparatively small number of applications that are involved in your request, and taking into consideration that the successful applications will be publicised in future, we will not be disclosing the reviewer scores for the applications.

We are not obliged, under section 40(2) of the FOIA, to provide information that is the personal data of another person if releasing would contravene any of the provisions of the General Data Protection Regulation and the Data Protection Act 2018. In this instance we believe that the release of information would contravene the first data protection principle and therefore section 40(2) has been applied. The individuals concerned would not have an expectation that this information would be made publicly available. Section 40(2) is an absolute exemption and therefore a public interest test is not required.

Point (iii)
The panel guidance (as provided to you in response to point (i) previously) outlines that the panel’s recommendation will be a banding of proposals into a maximum of four groups (bands A-D) and that all proposals within a band would be considered equal.
The quality (i.e. a meeting’s ranked order/banding) would not be the sole consideration for funding as consideration is also given to the balance of the training portfolio.

Figure 1 below provides the band definitions. All proposals placed in a band by the panel are best described by that band definition.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Band</th>
<th>Definition</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>Highly appropriate proposals which fully meet all criteria OR meet all criteria with minor issues in only one.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td>Very good proposals which effectively meet all criteria, with only minor issues in one or two criteria.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>Good proposals which effectively meet the criteria with only minor issues across multiple criteria OR may have a major issue with one criterion.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D</td>
<td>Inadequate proposals which do not sufficiently meet the criteria AND/OR have major concerns in more than one criterion.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Panel K recommended that all the proposals considered by them fell into the top two bands. They therefore recommended that all the proposals were either ‘highly appropriate’ or ‘very good’.

Figure 2 represents the final recommendation of the panel regarding the quality of the proposals, and reflects any tensioning applied by panel chairs/roving panel members across the 19 panel meetings.

As previously noted, proposals within bands were considered to be of equal quality; no ranking within the bands should be assumed.

If you have any queries about this response please contact me, or if you are unhappy with the service you have received in relation to your request and wish to request a review of our decision, please write to:

**Complaints Officer**  
UK Research and Innovation  
Polaris House  
North Star Avenue  
Swindon  
SN2 1FL  
Email: foi@ukri.org

Please quote the reference number above in any future communications.

If you are still not content with the outcome of the review, you may apply to refer the matter to the Information Commissioner for a decision. Generally, the ICO cannot make a decision unless you have exhausted the review procedure provided by UKRI. The Information Commissioner can be contacted at:

**Information Commissioner**  
Wycliffe House,  
Water Lane  
Wilmslow
Cheshire
SK9 5AF

Enquiry/Information Line: Between 9am and 5pm Monday to Friday 0303 123 1113 or 01625 545745
Further information about the Office of the Information Commissioner can be found at
http://www.ico.gov.uk/

Yours sincerely,

UK Research and Innovation, Information Governance Team
Email: foi@ukri.org